EMPLOYMENT LAW:
CASES AND MATERIALS

Fifth Edition
LexisNexis Law School Publishing
Advisory Board

William Araiza
Professor of Law
Brooklyn Law School

Lenni B. Benson
Professor of Law & Associate Dean for Professional Development
New York Law School

Raj Bhala
Rice Distinguished Professor
University of Kansas, School of Law

Ruth Colker
Distinguished University Professor & Heck-Faust Memorial Chair in Constitutional Law
Ohio State University, Moritz College of Law

David Gamage
Assistant Professor of Law
UC Berkeley School of Law

Joan Heminway
College of Law Distinguished Professor of Law
University of Tennessee College of Law

Edward Imwinkelried
Edward L. Barrett, Jr. Professor of Law
UC Davis School of Law

David I. C. Thomson
LP Professor & Director, Lawyering Process Program
University of Denver, Sturm College of Law

Melissa Weresh
Director of Legal Writing and Professor of Law
Drake University Law School
EMPLOYMENT LAW: CASES AND MATERIALS

Fifth Edition

Steven L. Willborn
Judge Harry A. Spencer Professor of Law
University of Nebraska-Lincoln

Stewart J. Schwab
Allan R. Tessler Dean & Professor of Law
Cornell University

John F. Burton, Jr.
Professor Emeritus, School of Management and Labor Relations
Rutgers, The State University of New Jersey

Gillian L. L. Lester
Associate Dean & Professor of Law
University of California at Berkeley

LexisNexis
To Ted St. Antoine and Clyde Summers, 
inspirational leaders in the field of employment law

and

To Mom and Dad, 
my first and best teachers
—SLW

To Norma and 
Justin, Whitney, Weatherly, Zachary, and Quintin (1st edition)
Soren and Lehman (2nd edition additions)
Harris (3rd edition addition)
Juliet (4th edition addition),
and Auletta and Lincoln (a new generation for the 5th edition)
—SJS

To Janet
—JFB

To Eric and Grace and Rhys
—GLLL
Our primary goal in this edition has been to update and enhance the materials. Much has happened since we last revised the materials in 2007 and it was time to bring the materials up to date. At the same time, however, we used a general presumption against change. We tried to retain as many of the cases and as much of the structure of the book as possible, both to ease the transition for teachers and for substantive reasons. The cases, for the most part, work well as teaching tools and the structure of the book provides flexibility for the many different types of courses professors offer as “employment law.”

As with our prior editions, we have attempted to edit the materials unobtrusively. We did not indicate when we deleted footnotes and citations to authority, but when we deleted anything other than footnotes or citations, we used ellipses. Citations in cases were often revised without indication (for example, by removing parallel citations). Footnotes that remain have retained their original numbers. For our own citations, except for headings for principal materials, we have followed The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation (19th ed. 2010).

We offer thanks to all who have helped us with this project. We began working on this book nearly two decades ago, so some of these people may have helped us so long ago that they have forgotten the precise nature of their assistance. While we inevitably will overlook some colleagues, we want to single out for thanks Rick Bales, Todd Brown, Bill Corbett, Charles Craver, Avi Cutler, Ellen Dannin, Rob Denicola, Cynthia Farina, Catherine Fisk, Dan Foote, Marshall Huebner, Alan Hyde, Sam Issacharoff, Pauline Kim, Barbara Lee, William Lyons, Deborah Malamud, Peter Martin, Colleen Medill, Richard Moberly, Alison Morantz, Andrew Morriss, Russell Osgood, Ramona Paetzold, Randy Rabinowitz, Timothy Schmidle, Bob Schopp, Paul Secunda, Sidney Shapiro, Emily Spieler, Katherine Stone, Kent Syverud, Lach Taylor, David Torrey, John True, Rip Verkerke, Mark Webb, Saul Weiss, Charles Wolfram, Bob Works, Julius Young, and William Zachary. Research assistants who have helped us include Melissa Barber, Rebecca Burton, Catherine Cano, Michael Casas, Katherine Cheng, Chad Doornink, Mark Grimes, Kristina Hon, Shin Jung Hwang, Ann Juliano, Sohyun Kim, Jonah Lalas, Andrea Loux, Joshua Mahoney, Joshua Mayes, Katherine McMahon, Audra Mitchell, Rafael Morell, Dan Muffly, Michael Nolan, Mark Pilotin, Anne Marie Pisano, Gregory Porter, J. Michael Roebuck, Michael Rosen-Prinz, Rebecca Schonberg, Deborah Steiner, Leo Tsao, Andrew Verriere, and Xunze Xiu. David Michaels at the Occupational Safety and Health Administration provided valuable information. Librarians who have helped us significantly include Mitch Fontenot, Anna Kurtz, Kris Lauber, Eugene McElroy, Donna Schulman, and Beth McWilliams.
A special thanks to Carolyn Singleton and Kerry Acker who provided us with considerable secretarial assistance on the first edition and fourth editions, respectively. And, finally, thanks to Fran Warren who was our initial contact with the publisher so many years ago and to Pali Chheda who was our principal editor for this edition.

Steven L. Willborn
Lincoln, Nebraska

Stewart J. Schwab
Ithaca, New York

John F. Burton, Jr.
New Brunswick, New Jersey

Gillian L. L. Lester
Berkeley, California

December 2011
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## PART I
### INTRODUCTION TO EMPLOYMENT LAW

Chapter 1  
THEMES OF EMPLOYMENT LAW

Chapter 2  
LEGAL BOUNDARIES OF THE EMPLOYMENT RELATIONSHIP

**A. EMPLOYEES VERSUS INDEPENDENT CONTRACTORS**

- Secretary of Labor v. Lauritzen
  
**Notes**

**B. COVERED EMPLOYEES**

- Wolf v. Coca-Cola Co.
  
**Notes**

**C. COVERED EMPLOYERS**

- Zheng v. Liberty Apparel Co.
  
**Notes**

## PART II
### THE RISE AND FALL OF EMPLOYMENT AT WILL

Chapter 3  
HISTORICAL FOUNDATIONS OF EMPLOYMENT AT WILL

- Statute of Labourers
  
- Statute of Artificers

**Notes**

- William Blackstone, *Commentaries*
  
**Note**

- Horace Gay Wood, *Master and Servant*

**Notes**

- Jay M. Feinman, *The Development of the Employment at Will Rule*

**Note**

- Skagerberg v. Blandin Paper Co.

**Notes**

Chapter 4  
CONTRACT EROSIONS OF EMPLOYMENT AT WILL

**A. EXPRESS MODIFICATION OF AT-WILL CONTRACTS, WRITTEN AND ORAL**

- Chiodo v. General Waterworks Corp.

**Notes**

- Hetes v. Schefman & Miller Law Office

**Notes**
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Ohanian v. Avis Rent A Car System, Inc. ........................................ 74
Notes ................................................................................. 81

B. RELIANCE AND IMPLIED-IN-FACT CONTRACTS ......................... 83
Grouse v. Group Health Plan, Inc. ........................................... 83
Veno v. Meredith ..................................................................... 85
Notes ................................................................................. 88
Pugh v. See’s Candies, Inc. ...................................................... 90
Notes ................................................................................. 94

C. EMPLOYMENT MANUALS ...................................................... 98
Woolley v. Hoffmann-La Roche, Inc. ....................................... 98
Notes ............................................................................... 106
Demasse v. ITT Corp. ............................................................ 108
Notes ............................................................................... 115

Chapter 5 TORT EROSIONS OF EMPLOYMENT AT WILL ............. 117

A. WRONGFUL DISCHARGE IN VIOLATION OF PUBLIC POLICY ...... 117
Nees v. Hocks ........................................................................ 117
Notes ............................................................................... 120
Wright v. Shriners Hospital for Crippled Children .................. 126
Notes ............................................................................... 131
Balla v. Gambro, Inc. .............................................................. 133
Notes ............................................................................... 140
Johnston v. Del Mar Distributing Co. ...................................... 142
Notes ............................................................................... 145
Notes on Whistleblower Statutes ........................................... 146
Federal Protections for Financial Whistleblowers ............... 149
Richard Moberly, Sarbanes-Oxley’s Structural Model to Encourage Corporate Whistleblowers ........................................................................ 151

B. INTENTIONAL INFLICTION OF EMOTIONAL DISTRESS .......... 153
Agis v. Howard Johnson Co. .................................................... 155
Notes ............................................................................... 157
Bodewig v. K-Mart, Inc. .......................................................... 157
Notes ............................................................................... 161

Chapter 6 GOOD-FAITH LIMITATIONS ON EMPLOYMENT AT WILL ........................................................................ 167

Fortune v. National Cash Register Co. ...................................... 167
Notes ............................................................................... 171
Murphy v. American Home Products Corp. ........................... 174
Notes ............................................................................... 179
### TABLE OF CONTENTS

#### Chapter 7  
A COMPARATIVE LOOK AT TERMINATION LAWS . 183

A. STATUTORY CHANGES TO EMPLOYMENT AT WILL ........... 183  
B. DISMISSAL STANDARDS IN OTHER COUNTRIES ............... 186  
   International Labour Organization, Convention 158: Termination of  
   Employment ...................................... 188

#### PART III  
EMPLOYEE PRIVACY ................................. 193

#### Chapter 8  
EMPLOYEE FREE SPEECH AND POLITICAL PROTECTIONS .......... 195

A. CONSTITUTIONAL PROTECTIONS FOR PUBLIC-SECTOR WORKERS ............................................ 196  
   Engquist v. Oregon Dep’t of Agriculture .................... 196  
   Notes .............................................. 204  
   Rutan v. Republican Party ................................ 205  
   Notes .............................................. 211  
   Garcetti v. Ceballos ................................ 213  
   Notes .............................................. 221  
B. POLITICAL AND SPEECH RIGHTS IN THE PRIVATE WORKPLACE ......................................... 224  
   Novosel v. Nationwide Insurance Co. ....................... 224  
   Notes .............................................. 229  
   Timekeeping Systems, Inc. ................................ 230  
   Notes .............................................. 235

#### Chapter 9  
EMPLOYEE PRIVACY RIGHTS ON AND OFF THE JOB ........... 239

A. ON-THE-JOB PRIVACY CLAIMS .......................... 239  
   City of Ontario v. Quon ................................ 239  
   Notes .............................................. 246  
   K-Mart Corp. Store No. 7441 v. Trott . .................... 248  
   Notes .............................................. 250  
   Pure Power Boot Camp v. Warrior Fitness Boot Camp .... 253  
   Notes .............................................. 261  
B. OFF-WORK PRIVACY CLAIMS .............................. 263  
   Brunner v. Al Attar ................................ 263  
   Notes .............................................. 264  
   Rulon-Miller v. International Business Machine Corp. ...... 267  
   Notes .............................................. 273  
C. DRUG TESTING ....................................... 274  
   1. Public-Employee Challenges ............................. 276
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

2. Private-Employee Challenges ........................................... 277
   
   *Sims v. NCI Holding Corp.* ........................................ 278
   
   Notes ................................................................. 282

D. HONESTY TESTS AND OTHER KINDS OF BACKGROUND SCREENING .......................... 289

   Notes ................................................................. 290
   
   *Soroka v. Dayton Hudson Corp.* .................................. 291
   
   Notes ................................................................. 298
   
   Note on Negligent Hiring ........................................... 305
   
   *Thatcher v. Brennan* ............................................... 305
   
   Notes ................................................................. 308

Chapter 10 EMPLOYER REFERENCES — DEFAMATION AND OTHER TORTS ......................... 311

   *Elbeshbeshy v. Franklin Institute* ............................... 312
   
   Notes ................................................................. 313
   
   *Zinda v. Louisiana Pacific Corp.* ................................ 315
   
   Notes ................................................................. 320
   
   *Sigal Construction Corp. v. Stanbury* ......................... 321
   
   Notes ................................................................. 326

PART IV EMPLOYEE DUTIES AND PROMISES ................. 331

Chapter 11 DUTY OF LOYALTY AND TRADE SECRETS ......... 333

   *Jet Courier Service v. Mulei* .................................. 333
   
   Notes ................................................................. 340
   
   *Dicks v. Jensen* .................................................. 341
   
   Note ................................................................. 345
   
   *PepsiCo, Inc. v. Redmond* ....................................... 345
   
   Notes ................................................................. 352

Chapter 12 ENFORCEMENT OF NONCOMPETITION CLAUSES . 355

   *Rem Metals Corp. v. Logan* ..................................... 355
   
   Notes ................................................................. 358
   
   *Karpinski v. Ingrasci* ............................................ 359
   
   Notes ................................................................. 363
   
   *BDO Seidman v. Hirshberg* ....................................... 365
   
   Notes ................................................................. 371

Chapter 13 EMPLOYEE INVENTIONS ................................. 377

   *Fracklyn v. Guilford Packing Co.* ............................... 377
   
   Note ................................................................. 381
   
   *Ingersoll-Rand Co. v. Ciavatta* ................................. 381
   
   Notes ................................................................. 390
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## PART V PROHIBITIONS ON STATUS DISCRIMINATION . . . . . 393

### Chapter 14 PROOF AND REMEDY IN EMPLOYMENT DISCRIMINATION CASES . . . . . 395

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A.</td>
<td><strong>INDIVIDUAL DISPARATE TREATMENT</strong></td>
<td>395</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>The Basic Model</td>
<td>395</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>McDonnell Douglas Corp. v. Green</em></td>
<td>395</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>398</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Price Waterhouse v. Hopkins</em></td>
<td>400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Note</td>
<td>409</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Desert Palace, Inc. v. Costa</em></td>
<td>409</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>414</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Under the Age Discrimination In Employment Act</td>
<td>416</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Gross v. FBL Financial Services, Inc.</em></td>
<td>416</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>425</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Applied to Sex-Based Social Conventions</td>
<td>426</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Jespersen v. Harrah’s Operating Company</em></td>
<td>426</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>434</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>The Bona Fide Occupational Qualification Defense</td>
<td>436</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Western Air Lines, Inc. v. Criswell</em></td>
<td>436</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>441</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.</td>
<td><strong>SYSTEMIC DISPARATE TREATMENT</strong></td>
<td>443</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Hazelwood School District v. United States</em></td>
<td>443</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>450</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.</td>
<td><strong>DISPARATE IMPACT</strong></td>
<td>454</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>The Basic Model</td>
<td>454</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Griggs v. Duke Power Co.</em></td>
<td>454</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>457</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Under the Age Discrimination in Employment Act</td>
<td>459</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Meacham v. Knolls Atomic Power Laboratory</em></td>
<td>459</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>466</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Relationship Between Disparate Treatment and Disparate Impact</td>
<td>468</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Ricci v. DeStefano</em></td>
<td>468</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>487</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D.</td>
<td><strong>SEXUAL HARASSMENT</strong></td>
<td>488</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Harris v. Forklift Systems, Inc.</em></td>
<td>488</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>492</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Oncale v. Sundowner Offshore Services, Inc.</em></td>
<td>493</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>497</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Lyle v. Warner Brothers Television Productions</em></td>
<td>498</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>507</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Faragher v. City of Boca Raton ........................................... 508
Notes ............................................................................. 518
E. DISABILITY DISCRIMINATION ....................................... 520
Gil v. Vortex, LLC .......................................................... 521
Notes ............................................................................. 526
US Airways, Inc. v. Barnett .................................................. 528
Notes ............................................................................. 542
Hoffman v. Carefirst of Fort Wayne, Inc. ............................. 546
Note ............................................................................. 553
F. AFFIRMATIVE ACTION AND THE PROBLEMS OF REMEDIES . . . 554
Johnson v. Transportation Agency ......................................... 554
Notes ............................................................................. 563
Taxman v. Board of Education ............................................. 564
Notes ............................................................................. 573
PART VI REGULATION OF COMPENSATION .................... 575
Chapter 15 WAGES AND HOURS LEGISLATION ............... 577
A. THE HISTORY OF WAGE AND HOUR REGULATION IN THE UNITED STATES ............................................. 577
Lochner v. New York ......................................................... 577
Notes ............................................................................. 584
Notes ............................................................................. 592
B. THE FAIR LABOR STANDARDS ACT ................................. 592
1. Substantive Obligations of the FLSA ................................. 593
a. Minimum Wages ....................................................... 594
  Notes ............................................................................. 597
b. Premium Pay for Overtime Hours ................................... 600
  Notes ............................................................................. 602
c. Restrictions on the Use of Child Labor ............................. 604
  Notes ............................................................................. 606
d. Problems with Implementing the Substantive Obligations .... 607
  Bright v. Houston Northwest Medical Center Survivor, Inc. .... 607
  Notes ............................................................................. 614
  Marshall v. Sam Dell’s Dodge Corp. ................................. 615
  Notes ............................................................................. 620
  Dunlop v. Gray-Goto, Inc. ................................................. 620
  Notes ............................................................................. 622
2. Coverage ..................................................................... 623

xii
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

- **Morgan v. Family Dollar Stores, Inc.** .................................................. 624
  - Notes ............................................................................................................. 630

C. **WAGE-PAYMENT LAWS** ................................................................. 632
  - **Beckwith v. United Parcel Service** ...................................................... 632
  - Notes ............................................................................................................. 634

**Chapter 16**  
**UNEMPLOYMENT AND UNEMPLOYMENT INSURANCE** .......................... 637

A. **SKETCHES OF THE UNEMPLOYED** ............................................ 637
  - Louis Uchitelle, *The Disposable American: Layoffs and their Consequences* ........................................ 637
  - H.G. Kaufman, *Professionals in Search of Work: Coping with the Stress of Job Loss and Underemployment* .... 639

B. **THE UNEMPLOYMENT INSURANCE PROGRAM** ............................ 641
  1. History and Financial Structure of Unemployment Insurance ........ 641
  2. Causes of Unemployment and the Role of UI ................................. 645
     - Gillian Lester, *Unemployment Insurance and Wealth Redistribution* .............. 646
     - UI and Job Search Behavior ........................................................................ 648
     - Experience Rating and Employer Layoff Behavior .................................... 649
       - Advisory Council on Unemployment Compensation, *Unemployment Insurance in the United States* .... 649
       - Note ............................................................................................................. 654
  3. Work Search Requirements ................................................................. 654
     - *Knox v. Unemployment Compensation Board of Review* .......................... 655
     - Notes ............................................................................................................. 656

C. **DISQUALIFICATIONS FROM UI BENEFITS** .................................. 658
  - Note ............................................................................................................. 660
  1. Voluntary Quits ....................................................................................... 661
     - *Wimberly v. Labor & Industrial Relations Commission* ....................... 661
     - Note ............................................................................................................. 665
     - *MacGregor v. Unemployment Insurance Appeals Board* ....................... 665
     - Notes ............................................................................................................. 670
     - *Jones v. Review Board of Indiana Employment Security Division* ....... 671
     - Notes ............................................................................................................. 672
  2. Willful Misconduct .................................................................................. 673
     - *McCourtney v. Imprimis Technology, Inc.* .............................................. 673
     - Notes ............................................................................................................. 676

D. **FEDERAL REGULATION OF PLANT CLOSINGS** ......................... 677
  - Barry Bluestone & Bennett Harrison, *The Deindustrialization of America* .............................. 677
## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Worker Adjustment and Retraining Notification
Act of 1988 ........................................ 681
Roquet v. Arthur Andersen LLP .......................... 682
Notes .............................................. 687

PART VII EMPLOYEE BENEFITS ......................... 689

Chapter 17 LEAVE TIME ................................. 697
A.  THE RIGHT TO LEAVE TIME ............................. 698
   Whitaker v. Bosch Braking Systems Division ............... 698
   Notes .............................................. 704
   Byrne v. Avon Products, Inc. ........................... 706
   Notes .............................................. 708
B.  THE CONDITIONS OF THE LEAVE ......................... 710
   Rogers v. City of San Antonio .......................... 710
   Notes .............................................. 717

Chapter 18 PENSIONS ................................... 721
A.  THE PROBLEM WITH PENSIONS ......................... 721
   McNevin v. Solvay Process Co. .......................... 721
   Notes .............................................. 725
   The Employee Retirement Income Security Act of 1974 726
   Notes .............................................. 727
B.  PROTECTING EMPLOYEES FROM FORFEITURE .......... 728
   Nemeth v. Clark Equipment Co. .......................... 730
   Notes .............................................. 735
C.  FIDUCIARY DUTIES ................................ 737
   Donovan v. Bierwirth ................................ 737
   Notes .............................................. 745
   LaRue v. Dewolff, Boberg & Associates, Inc. ............... 745
   Lorenzen v. Employees Retirement Plan of the Sperry &
    Hutchinson Co. ..................................... 751
   Notes .............................................. 754
   Beach v. Commonwealth Edison Company .................... 757
   Note ............................................... 766
D.  PLAN ADMINISTRATION ................................ 767
   Metropolitan Life Insurance Company v. Glenn .................... 767
   Notes .............................................. 777
E.  PLANS OF DISTRESSED EMPLOYERS .................... 777
   Defined-Benefit Plans ................................ 778
   Pension Benefit Guaranty Corp. v. LTV Corp. ............... 778

xiv
Table of Contents

2. Defined-Contribution Plans ............................................. 788
   John H. Langbein, The Enron Pension Investment Catastrophe: Why
   It Happened and How Congress Should Fix It .................. 788
   Notes .............................................................. 792

F. RETIREMENT SECURITY AND EMPLOYER-SPONSORED
   PENSIONS .......................................................... 794
   Michael J. Graetz, The Troubled Marriage of Retirement Security
   and Tax Policies .................................................. 794
   Notes .............................................................. 796

Chapter 19 EMPLOYER-Provided HEALTH INSURANCE ............. 799
A. THINKING ABOUT AN EMPLOYMENT-BASED HEALTH CARE
   SYSTEM .............................................................. 801
   Timothy Stoltzfus Jost, Private or Public Approaches to Insuring the
   Uninsured: Lessons from International Experience with
   Private Insurance .................................................. 802
   Notes .............................................................. 806
B. ERISA PREEMPTION .................................................. 807
   Metropolitan Life Insurance Co. v. Massachusetts ............. 808
   Notes .............................................................. 814
   Retail Industry Leaders Association v. Fielder ................. 816
   Notes .............................................................. 825
C. PROBLEMS WITH ENFORCEMENT .................................. 827
   Corcoran v. United Healthcare, Inc. ............................. 827
   Notes .............................................................. 836
D. ACA AND THE LIMITATIONS OF EMPLOYER-ProvidED
   HEALTH INSURANCE ............................................. 838
   Council of Economic Advisers, The Economic Case for
   Health Care Reform ............................................. 840
   Lawrence H. Summers, Some Simple Economics of Mandated
   Benefits ............................................................. 843
   Notes .............................................................. 847

PART VIII WORKPLACE INJURIES AND DISEASES .............. 849

Chapter 20 THE PRESTATUTORY APPROACHES ...................... 855
A. THE LABOR MARKET .................................................. 855
   Ronald G. Ehrenberg, Workers’ Compensation, Wages, and the Risk of
   Injury ............................................................... 855
   Notes .............................................................. 857
TABLE OF CONTENTS

B. TORT SUITS .......................................... 859
   Farwell v. Boston & Worcester Rail Road Corp. ................ 859
   Notes .............................................. 862

Chapter 21 WORKERS’ COMPENSATION ................... 865
A. THE ORIGINS OF WORKERS’ COMPENSATION .............. 865
   C. Arthur Williams, Jr. & Peter S. Barth, *Compendium on Workmen’s
      Compensation* ........................................ 865
   New York Central Railroad Co. v. White ..................... 868
   Notes .............................................. 871
B. AN OVERVIEW OF CURRENT WORKERS’ COMPENSATION
   PROGRAMS ........................................... 875
   1. Coverage of Employees and Employers ...................... 875
   2. Coverage of Injuries and Diseases .......................... 875
   3. Medical Care and Rehabilitation Services ................. 876
   4. Cash Benefits ........................................ 876
      a. Temporary Total Disability Benefits ....................... 877
      b. Temporary Partial Disability Benefits ...................... 877
      c. Permanent Partial Disability Benefits ....................... 877
      d. Permanent Total Disability Benefits ....................... 878
      e. Death Benefits ....................................... 878
   5. Financing of Benefits ................................... 879
   6. Administration of Workers’ Compensation .................... 880
      a. The Initial Responsibility for Payment ...................... 880
      b. The Functions of the Administrative Agency ................. 880
      c. Closing Cases ....................................... 880
      d. Extent of Attorney Involvement .......................... 881
   7. Federal and State Responsibilities ........................... 881
C. THE EXCLUSIVITY OF WORKERS’ COMPENSATION .......... 882
   1. Tort Suits and Other Legal Actions Against the Employer .... 882
       *Millison v. E.I. du Pont de Nemours & Co.* .............. 882
       Notes ............................................ 887
   2. No Remedy Against the Employer? .......................... 893
       *Livtasanos v. Superior Court* ............................ 893
       Notes ............................................ 900
   3. To Whom Does the Exclusive Remedy Doctrine Apply? ........ 902
       Notes ............................................ 903
D. WHICH INJURIES ARE COMPENSABLE? ..................... 907
   1. Test One: In the Course of Employment ...................... 908
      a. Activity: Mixed Social and Business Activities .......... 908
         *Ezzy v. Workers’ Compensation Appeals Board* .......... 908
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Note ............................................ 913

b. Activity: Horseplay ................................... 914
   *Prows v. Industrial Commission* .................. 914
   Note ............................................. 920

c. Time and Place: Going and Coming Rule ............. 920
   *Santa Rosa Junior College v. Workers’ Compensation*
   *Appeals Board* ................................... 920
   Notes ............................................ 927

2. Test Two: Arising Out of Employment .................. 929
   *Donahue v. Maryland Casualty Co.* ............... 931
   *Katz v. A. Kadans & Co.* .......................... 932
   Notes ............................................ 933
   *Hanson v. Reichelt* ................................ 934
   Notes ............................................ 938
   *Nippert v. Shinn Farm Construction Co.* .......... 939
   Note ............................................. 941

3. Tradeoffs Between Tests One And Two .................. 942
   *Technical Tape Corp. v. Industrial Commission* ... 942
   Notes ............................................ 944

4. Test Three: Accident ................................ 945
   *Matthews v. R.T. Allen & Sons* ..................... 945
   Notes ............................................ 949

5. Test Four: Personal Injury ............................ 950
   Note ............................................. 951

E. WHICH DISEASES ARE COMPENSABLE? ................... 951
   *Tisco Intermountain v. Industrial Commission* .... 951
   Notes ............................................ 953

F. INJURIES AND DISEASES FOR WHICH COMPENSABILITY IS PROBLEMATIC .............................. 956
   1. Workplace Stress .................................. 956
      *Chicago Board of Education v. Industrial Commission* 956
      Notes ............................................ 961
   2. Trends in Compensability ............................ 964
      Emily A. Spieler & John F. Burton, Jr., *Compensation For Disabled Workers: Workers’ Compensation* 964
      Notes ............................................ 966
      *Brodie v. Workers’ Compensation Appeals Bd.* ....... 968
      Note ............................................. 977

G. CASH BENEFITS ....................................... 978
   1. Temporary Disability Benefits ........................ 980
      a. Temporary Total Disability Benefits .............. 980
         *Tobin v. All Shore All Star* ....................... 980
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Note ............................................ 982
b. Temporary Partial Disability Benefits ........................................ 983
   Carr v. Virginia Electric & Power Co. ........................................ 983
   Note ............................................ 986
2. Permanent Partial Disability Benefits ........................................ 986
a. Introduction ........................................ 986
b. Scheduled Permanent Partial Disability Benefits ................... 987
c. System I PPD Benefits: Nonscheduled PPD Benefits Based on Impairment ........................................ 987
d. System II PPD Benefits: Nonscheduled PPD Benefits Based on Loss of Earning Capacity ........................................ 987
   Sjoberg’s Case ........................................ 988
e. System III PPD Benefits: Nonscheduled PPD Benefits Based on Actual Wage Loss ........................................ 989
   Leeberv. LILCO ........................................ 990
   Notes ............................................. 991
f. System IV PPD Benefits: Unitary Rating System for PPD Benefits ........................................ 992
3. Permanent Total Disability Benefits ........................................ 992
Guyton v. Irving Jensen Co. ........................................ 993
4. Death Benefits ........................................ 996
H. MEDICAL AND REHABILITATION BENEFITS ........................................ 996
   Petrilla v. Workmen’s Compensation Appeal Board ........................................ 997
   Notes .............................................. 1001
   Shawnee Management Corp. v. Hamilton ........................................ 1002
   Note .............................................. 1004

Chapter 22 THE OCCUPATIONAL SAFETY AND HEALTH ACT ........................................ 1005
A. AN OVERVIEW OF THE ACT ........................................ 1006
1. Coverage ........................................... 1006
2. OSHA’s Administrative Structure ........................................ 1006
3. Promulgation of Standards ........................................ 1007
4. Interim Standards ........................................ 1007
5. Emergency Temporary Standards ........................................ 1008
6. Permanent Standards ........................................ 1009
7. Variances ........................................... 1011
8. The General Duty Clause ........................................ 1011
9. Enforcement ........................................ 1011
10. Procedure in Contested Cases ........................................ 1012
11. Imminent Danger ........................................ 1013
12. State Plans ........................................ 1013
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>13. Other Provisions of the Act</td>
<td>1013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. The Small Business Regulatory Enforcement Fairness Act</td>
<td>1014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. The Government Performance and Results Modernization Act</td>
<td>1014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. The Environmental Protection Agency</td>
<td>1015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>B. SUBSTANTIVE CRITERIA FOR OSHA STANDARDS</strong></td>
<td>1015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The First and Second Criteria: Technological and Economic Feasibility</td>
<td>1016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>AFL-CIO v. Brennan</strong></td>
<td>1016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Note</strong></td>
<td>1019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The Third Criterion: Benefits to Workers’ Health or Safety</td>
<td>1020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The Fourth Criterion: Cost-Benefit Analysis</td>
<td>1023</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>C. LEGAL CHALLENGES TO PERMANENT STANDARDS</strong></td>
<td>1027</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Notes</strong></td>
<td>1029</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>American Textile Manufacturers Institute v. Donovan</strong></td>
<td>1030</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Notes</strong></td>
<td>1039</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Generic Rulemaking</strong></td>
<td>1040</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>AFL-CIO v. OSHA</strong></td>
<td>1042</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Notes</strong></td>
<td>1051</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>D. THE GENERAL DUTY CLAUSE</strong></td>
<td>1054</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Note</strong></td>
<td>1058</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>National Realty &amp; Construction Co. v. OSHRC</strong></td>
<td>1054</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Note</strong></td>
<td>1058</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>E. ENFORCEMENT</strong></td>
<td>1063</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Marshall v. Barlow’s, Inc.</strong></td>
<td>1066</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Notes</strong></td>
<td>1072</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>F. EMPLOYEE RIGHTS AND RESPONSIBILITIES</strong></td>
<td>1073</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Atlantic &amp; Gulf Stevedores, Inc. v. OSHA</strong></td>
<td>1073</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Whirlpool Corp. v. Marshall</strong></td>
<td>1081</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Notes</strong></td>
<td>1088</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>G. EMPLOYER RESPONSIBILITIES</strong></td>
<td>1089</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Note</strong></td>
<td>1090</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Secretary of Labor v. Summit Contractors, Inc.</strong></td>
<td>1094</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Note</strong></td>
<td>1094</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>National Association of Home Builders v. OSHA</strong></td>
<td>1094</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Note</strong></td>
<td>1097</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>H. FEDERAL VERSUS STATE AUTHORITY FOR WORKPLACE SAFETY AND HEALTH</strong></td>
<td>1097</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. State Authority Ceded Under OSHA</td>
<td>1097</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Other Sources of State Authority</td>
<td>1098</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Gade v. National Solid Wastes Management Association</strong></td>
<td>1099</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Notes</strong></td>
<td>1107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Criminal Prosecutions of Employers</td>
<td>1109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>People v. Chicago Magnet Wire Corp.</strong></td>
<td>1109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Notes</strong></td>
<td>1114</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TABLE OF CONTENTS

4. Tort Suits ........................................... 1117

Chapter 23 RETHINKING THE APPROACHES TO WORKPLACE INJURIES AND DISEASES .......................... 1119

A. THE LABOR MARKET ..................................... 1119
   Economic Report of the President .......................... 1119
   Note .............................................. 1120
B. TORT SUITS .......................................... 1121
   Economic Report of the President .......................... 1121
   John F. Burton, Jr., Workers' Compensation ............ 1122
   Notes ............................................. 1125
C. WORKERS' COMPENSATION .............................. 1127
   Economic Report of the President .......................... 1127
   Note .............................................. 1128
   H. Allan Hunt, Adequacy of Earnings Replacement in
      Workers' Compensation Programs ......................... 1128
   Monroe Berkowitz & John F. Burton, Jr., Permanent Disability
   Benefits in Workers' Compensation ......................... 1130
   John F. Burton, Jr., Workers' Compensation ............ 1132
   Note .............................................. 1135
D. THE OCCUPATIONAL SAFETY AND HEALTH ACT ............ 1136
   Economic Report of the President .......................... 1136
   Notes ............................................. 1137
   Sidney A. Shapiro, Occupational Safety and Health Regulation 1138
   John F. Burton, Jr. & James R. Chelius, Workplace Safety and Health
   Regulations: Rationale and Results ......................... 1139
   Notes ............................................. 1141

PART IX ENFORCEMENT OF EMPLOYMENT RIGHTS ...... 1143

Chapter 24 COMMON ENFORCEMENT ISSUES ............... 1145

A. WHO ENFORCES? ....................................... 1145
   Christiansburg Garment Co. v. EEOC ....................... 1145
   Notes ............................................. 1150
B. WHO BENEFITS? ........................................ 1151
   Bahramipour v. Citigroup Global Markets, Inc. ............ 1151
   Notes ............................................. 1154
C. REMEDIES ............................................... 1157
   Balbuena v. IDR Realty LLC ................................ 1157
   Notes ............................................. 1162
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter 25  ARBITRATION OF EMPLOYMENT DISPUTES  . . . . . . 1165

A. INTRODUCTION ........................................... 1165
   *Gilmer v. Interstate/Johnson Lane Corp.* ................ 1166
   Notes .................................................. 1174

B. STATE CLAIMS AND THE FAA ............................. 1179
   *Little v. Auto Stiegler, Inc.* .......................... 1179
   Notes ................................................ 1187

C. IMPLEMENTATION ......................................... 1187

Table of Cases .............................................. TC-1

Index ........................................................ I-1