

---

---

# COMPARATIVE LABOR LAW & POLICY JOURNAL

Volume 39, Number 1 Fall 2017

---

---

## MIGRANT WORKERS

Dishing Up Migrant Workers for the Canadian Food Services Sector: Labor Law and the Demand for Migrant Workers <i>Judy Fudge and Joo-Cheong Tham</i> .....	1
Undefined Rights: The Challenge of Using Evolving Labor Standards in U.S. and Canadian Free Trade Agreements to Improve Working Women’s Lives <i>Tequila J. Brooks</i> .....	29
Disaggregating Labor Migration Policies to Understand Aggregate Migration Realities: Insights from South Korea and Japan as Negative Cases of Immigration <i>Erin Aeran Chung and Ralph I. Hosoki</i> ...	83
The Precarity of Temporality: How Law Inhibits Immigrant Worker Claims <i>Kati L. Griffith and Shannon M. Gleeson</i> ..	111
“We Asked for Workers . . .” Legal Rules on Temporary Labor Migration in the European Union and in Germany <i>Constanze Janda</i> .....	143
Back Door, Side Door, or Front Door? An Emerging De-Facto Low-Skilled Immigration Policy in Australia <i>Chris F. Wright and Stephen Clibborn</i> .....	165
Guest or Temporary Foreign Worker Programs <i>Philip Martin</i> .....	189
<hr/>	
Inclusion, Reversal, or Displacement? Classifying Regulatory Approaches to Pay Equity <i>Meg Smith, Robyn Layton, and Andrew Stewart</i> .....	211
<hr/>	

**DEBATE ON WORKER'S COMPENSATION**

Is the Work-Related Test Desirable for All Diseases That  
Disable Workers?  
*John F. Burton, Jr.* ..... 247

Should the Proposed WDPA Replace Work-Related  
Tests for Occupational Diseases? A Response to John  
Burton's Recent Article on Worker's Compensation  
Policy  
*Stephen J. Adler* ..... 273

---

Cite as  
39 Comp. Lab. L. & Pol'y J. \_\_\_\_ (2017)

---

---

---

# COMPARATIVE LABOR LAW & POLICY JOURNAL

---

---

UNIVERSITY OF ILLINOIS COLLEGE OF LAW

## EDITORS AND EDITORIAL BOARD

Volume 39  
2017–2018

### GENERAL EDITORS

Matthew W. Finkin, *Albert J. Harno and Edward W. Cleary Chair in Law, University of Illinois College of Law*

Sanford M. Jacoby, *Howard Noble Professor of Management, Policy Studies & History, University of California at Los Angeles*

### SENIOR EDITORS

Janice R. Bellace, *Samuel Blank Professor of Legal Studies, The Wharton School, University of Pennsylvania*

Rolf Birk, *Director Emeritus, Institute for Labor Law and Labor Relations in the European Community, Trier, Germany*

Mark Freedland, *Professor of Employment Law Emeritus in the University of Oxford, England*

Alvin Goldman, *Salmon Professor of Law Emeritus, University of Kentucky College of Law*

Silvana Sciarra, *Judge, Italian Constitutional Court, Italy*

Kazuo Sugeno, *President, Japan Institute of Labor Policy & Training*

Manfred Weiss, *Professor of Law Emeritus, Frankfurt University, Germany*

### BOOK REVIEW EDITORS

Kevin Banks, *Associate Professor of Law, Queen's University, Canada*

Rebecca Kolins Givan, *Assistant Professor, School of Management and Labor, Relations Rutgers University Labor Education Center*

### DISPATCHES EDITOR

Sean Cooney, *Professor, University of Melbourne, Australia*

### EUROPEAN UNION DEVELOPMENTS EDITOR

Achim Seifert, *Professor of Law, Friedrich-Schiller University, Jena, Germany*

### EDITORIAL ADVISORY BOARD

James J. Brudney, *Professor of Law, Fordham University School of Law*

John L. Campbell, *Class of 1925 Professor, Dartmouth College*

Lance Compa, *Senior Lecturer, School of Industrial and Labor Relations, Cornell University*

Joel Cutcher-Gershenfeld, *Professor, Heller School of Social Policy and Management, Brandeis University*

Simon Deakin, *Professor of Law, University of Cambridge*

Cynthia Estlund, *Professor of Law, New York University School of Law*

Guy Davidov, *Elias Lieberman Chair in Labour Law, The Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Israel*

Roberto Fragale Filho, *Judge, Brazilian Labor Court & Professor of Law, Fluminense Federal University, Brazil*

Adrián Goldin, *Professor Plenario, Universidad de San Andrés, Argentina*

Thomas A. Kochan, *Bunker Professor of Management, Massachusetts Institute of Technology*

Thomas C. Kohler, *Professor of Law, Boston College Law School*

Jonas Malmberg, *President of the Swedish Labor Court, Sweden*

Jonas Pontusson, *Professor of Comparative Politics, Université de Genève, Switzerland*

Kerry Rittich, *Professor of Law, University of Toronto, Canada*

Monika Schlachter, *Director, Institute for Labor Law and Labor Relations in the European Union, Trier, Germany*

Alain Supiot, *Professor, Collège de France, France*

Peter Swenson, *Professor of Political Science, Yale University*

Kathleen Thelen, *Ford Professor of Political Science, Massachusetts Institute of Technology*

Gilles Trudeau, *Professor of Law, University of Montreal, Canada*

Jelle Visser, *Professor of Empirical Sociology, University of Amsterdam, Netherlands*

Steven L. Willborn, *Schmoker Professor of Law, University of Nebraska Law School*

#### MANAGING EDITOR

Stacey Ballmes, *University of Illinois College of Law*

## EDITORIAL POLICY

The *Journal* is interested in considering work that includes, but is by no means limited to:

- Empirical analyses, case studies, or doctrinal comparisons treating common labor, employment, or social security issues in two or more countries.
- Treatment of theoretical, methodological, or historical issues in comparative labor law or comparative employment and social policy.
- Scholarship on mixed systems of law or of supranational legal regulation.
- Analysis of legislative, administrative, or judicial developments in a single country that has transnational implications or that relate to potential international trends.
- Discussion of economic, social, or cultural aspects of the portability of legal rules or policy approaches.

The *Journal* should wish to consider publishing not only articles, book reviews, and essays, but as a means of broadening awareness and stimulating debate would also be pleased to consider:

- Important extracts or summary conclusions of recent studies funded by foundations, governments, and international organizations, especially in advance of the appearances of the full reports.
- Chapters from published or unpublished dissertations, *Festschriften*, and other specialized compendia that might not otherwise be known to the *Journal's* worldwide readership.
- Speeches, conference papers, or translations of significant works not appearing in English.
- Detailed bibliographies on comparative issues in labor law, employment policy, or social security.

## ADVICE ON SUBMISSIONS

*Comparative Labor Law & Policy Journal* is professionally edited and refereed. Manuscripts will ordinarily be submitted anonymously for comment of experts in the field. Authors will be notified when the editors believe that the submission would benefit from such evaluation; they will be expected to revise in light of the reviewers' recommendations. Submission to an external review must be understood to give the *Journal* a right of first refusal to the manuscript.

Manuscripts must be submitted in English. Articles should ordinarily be from 5,000 to 12,000 words (twenty to fifty double-spaced, typed pages). PLEASE NOTE THAT - CONSISTENT WITH THE PRACTICE OF PROFESSIONALLY EDITED PUBLICATIONS - MULTIPLE SUBMISSIONS ARE NOT ACCEPTED. If accepted for publication, the article may be edited for purposes of fluency and comprehension.

All manuscripts should be submitted on 8½" x 11" paper (double spaced with wide margins) *or* as an attachment in e-mail, sent in Word format. Footnotes should conform to the Uniform System of Citations commonly used in U.S. schools of law. Submissions should be directed to:

*Comparative Labor Law & Policy Journal*  
University of Illinois College of Law  
119 Law Building  
504 East Pennsylvania Avenue  
Champaign, IL 61820, U.S.A.

Attn: Managing Editor  
tel: (217) 333-9852  
fax: (217) 244-1478  
e-mail: law-cllpj@illinois.edu

## BOOKS FOR REVIEW

Books for review may be sent to the above address or to the respective book review editors.

**For law:**

Kevin Banks  
Director, Centre for Law in the Contemporary Workplace  
Associate Professor of Law  
Queen's University  
128 Union Street, Room C527a  
Kingston, ON K7L 3N6  
tel: 613-533-6000 x 79244  
fax: 613-533-6509  
e-mail: banksk@queensu.ca

**For non-law:**

Rebecca Kolins Givan  
Assistant Professor  
School of Management and Labor  
Relations Rutgers University Labor Education Center  
50 Labor Center Way  
New Brunswick, NJ 08903  
tel: 848-932-2030  
e-mail: rgivan@work.rutgers.edu

The *Journal* appears on the computerized legal research services and *WestLaw*. It is also indexed in *Current Law Index*, *Index to Legal Periodicals*, and *LegalTrac* databases.